

GENDER WAGE GAP: IMPACT RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Impact Luncheon: Held June 28, 2017, YWCA Utah

Participants: Senator Jani Iwamoto, Representative Rebecca Chavez-Houck, Erin Jemison (YWCA Utah), Lecia Langston (DWS), Susan Madsen (UWLP, UVU), Carrie Mayne (DWS), Stephanie Pitcher (Utah Women’s Coalition), Robbyn Scribner (UVU)

Categories	Current Resources/Strengths	Gaps/Challenges	Potential Interventions
1. Financial incentives and support	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ElevateHER Challenge raises awareness in companies on economic value of gender equity. Utah Women & Leadership Project (UWLP) provide research reports. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No incentives being explored for companies/organizations regarding gender equity. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Talk more about value of companies coming in about gender equity, not just about number of jobs coming in. Increase awareness of the gender wage gap to organizations/entities in all sectors (e.g., business, nonprofit, government, education) Develop resources that help organizations understand interventions that could be taken to address these issues.
2. Technology Infrastructure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Transparency Utah website Right to Know website 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Right to Know website problematic because it includes benefits but does not break them out separately, which is not as effective. Transparency Utah does not show experience, tenure, etc. so its use is somewhat limited. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continue to develop and strengthen these websites to include more nuances of compensation and improve the accuracy and clarity of the pay in Utah.
3. Creation of economic opportunity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Addressing occupational segregation through programs related to STEM like SheTech. Women’s Business Center and other BRCs provide resources for women to state businesses. Other 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 70% of women don’t have higher education; when these women experience a gap, it really affects their ability to put food on the table. Lack of access to affordable childcare and eldercare; this impedes the earning power of women who often take on that caregiving responsibility. Utah still has less women majoring in STEM, business, and other potential higher earning fields when compared to the nation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to focus many efforts on less educated women and how this impacts their families more. Promoting certifications and other training that lead to higher paying jobs is important too—in addition to associate, bachelor’s, and graduate degrees. Make sure we’re focusing on natural sciences in STEM, not just tech; increase awareness of all of the options women can choose to major in college. Focus on management training as well. Young people need more awareness and education about reality of economic life.
4. Capacity building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ElevateHER Challenge UWLP reports and events 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Unconscious bias among employers in Utah is strong. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop pool of stories in order to amplify voices and demonstrate that the problem

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Other women’s groups/networking offer training and development through speakers (see https://www.usu.edu/uwlp/events/) • Some companies are addressing the gap by giving different percentage increases 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Socialization and other barriers for women in making “choices,” negotiating, etc. • Utah businesses discuss lack of qualified applicant pool, which is a real challenge in our state; yet, women are an untapped resource. • School counselors are still directing girls and children of color in certain directions. • There is still a lack of availability of school counselors in general. • Hostile atmosphere in certain occupations for women. • Many companies still in denial that this is an issue/even exists. 	<p>exists.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Highlight/promote companies that are doing well. • Companies/orgs/agencies helping each other address these issues (e.g., differentials in raises, training) • Training and education for employers. • Skill- and confidence-building for women. • Tap into businesses’ need for more skilled applicants/employees. • More work with school counselors/parents to get women in non-traditional careers, which usually leads to higher pay. • Culture change in occupations that are hostile toward women; can’t just get more women in these careers, as industry needs to adapt so that women are retained in these positions. • Raise awareness and provide training regarding the need for women to support and mentor each other. • More school counselors need to be hired in general. • Real education of young people on financial consequences of education and/or career decisions. • Create support groups for women in nontraditional occupations.
5. Advocacy and shaping attitudes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An increase in media on the topic of gender wage gap. • There are some new efforts with statewide education of worker rights. • Women’s march and energy/enthusiasm that created. • More public engagement and responses to issues like the letter from Vice Chair of Wasatch County Republican Party 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employees/applicants are often unaware of their rights and what information they do/do not have to provide employers/potential employers. • People do not believe there’s a gap or misattribute reasons for it. • Socialization and individual choice are contributing factors in Utah. • Employers make decisions based on gender roles/assumptions, and unconscious bias in hiring, wages, promotion decisions is wide-spread; this is not just with male employers or 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More education and awareness statewide; employees need to know their rights and obligations. • Educate women on the labor market value of their work. • More empowerment for women in making different choices, negotiating, and advocating for themselves. • Training and education for employers around attitudes about gender roles, unconscious bias, etc. • Education and unconscious bias training for school counselors and how they direct

		<p>politically conservative individuals.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School counselors and parents still direct girls in certain direction and not others; some parents/families also still communicating to girls that they won't/won't need to work outside of the home. • Women are not promoted as rapidly as men. • Hostile work environment in some occupations, even if pay is equal. 	<p>children.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Change conversation – if it's truly a free market, commodity of the worker in what they return to the economy regardless of identity, personal circumstances, etc. [need Carrie to articulate in a one-pager, and we need to all “sing off the same song sheet.”] • Document stories to illustrate the issues and get skeptics on board. • Culture change in non-traditional occupations for women to decrease hostility and increase pay.
<p>6. Laws, policies, and regulations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sen. Iwamoto passed labor remedies bill last year; it brought back equal pay federal damages to Utah. • We have more than we think in Utah when you look at the statute or in case law. • The national AAUW has a chart/checklist for each state, and other reports give state comparison data. • There was an audit of UALD this past session and list of suggestions to address issues. • There was a Business and Labor Committee bill on these. • LDS Church announcing new paid family leave policy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our current equal pay statute does not include benefits. • Need to ban employers from asking employees/applicants about past salary; there may be more movement/possibilities at municipality and county levels. • Lack of paid leave impacts this issue as well. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sometimes we need to be careful with changing statute because they are able to address issues with case law; changing code can have unintended consequences. • Utah Women’s Coalition (UWC) is working with Rep. Edwards on a bill to lower threshold from 15 to 5 employees (compliance with anti-discrimination law). • Change conversation toward conservative policy argument – if it's truly a free market, commodity of the worker in what they return to the economy regardless of identity, personal circumstances, etc.; messaging is important. • Need stories to connect it to real people and create empathy; we can develop unexpected allies. UWC able to collect 200 on FMLA. Better utilize online tools to collect those stories. • Think strategically about the messenger on this issue to be persuasive. • Sophisticated messaging strategy to really lead change on this issue is needed. • Explore if Sen. Anderegg or anyone else is running a bill this session. • Support groups for those accessing legal remedies.

<p>7. Research and data</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UWLP snapshot released in August. • Graduate students who have done sophisticated modeling of related issues in Utah. • YWCA’s report from IWPR addresses Utah wage gap from census data. • After 30 years of stagnation, we have started to see improvement/progress in closing the wage gap. 	<p>8. Aggregate wage research is problematic because it does not include information on experience, education, occupation, etc. Census data distracts and confuses people.</p> <p>9. There is a substantial expense to get real information on scope of the problem in Utah; it is easy to discount the problem or claim it does not exist in our state.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are limitations to data from graduate research as well; there are many research variables that need to be taken into account to understand Utah and these issues, and grad students don’t understand those. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State agency specific information on extent of gap and how to address (Sen. Escamilla’s bill). • Information/data needs to be collected on what is happening in all states and what interventions seem to be working within companies, state and local governments (all sectors), and in terms of legislation, policy, and practices. • Investigate the possibility of research using data from the new Utah Data Research Center.
-----------------------------	---	--	--

This Impact Recommendation Report was compiled, drafted, and refined by Erin Jemison (Director of Public Policy, YWCA Utah) and Dr. Susan R. Madsen (Orin R. Woodbury Professor of Leadership & Ethics, Woodbury School of Business, Utah Valley University). For questions, contact Dr. Madsen at uwlp@usu.edu. For additional information, see the following websites: Utah Women & Leadership Project (www.utwomen.org) and YWCA Utah (<https://www.ywcautah.org/>).